#### Design of Walls for Axial Load and Outof-Plane Loads

TMS20210217

February 17, 2021

Richard M. Bennett, Ph.D., P.E., FTMS Professor University of Tennessee







The Masonry Society is a registered Provider with the American Institute of Architects Continuing Education Systems. Credit earned on completion of this program will be reported to CES Records for AIA members. Certificates of completion for non-AIA members are available upon request.

This program is registered with AIA/CES for continuing professional education. As such, it does not include content that may be deemed or construed to be an approval or endorsement by the AIA of any material of construction or any method or manner of handling, using, distributing or dealing in any material or product.

Questions related to specific materials, methods, and services will be addressed at the conclusion of this presentation.

## **Course Description**

During this session, design of masonry walls loaded with outof-plane loads and axial loads will be reviewed. Methods to consider secondary bending moments will be examined, including using P-delta provisions, and key points on interaction diagrams will be reviewed. Differences in the strength design provisions and allowable stress design will be briefly discussed.

#### **Learning Objectives**

- Review the design of walls loaded with out-of-plane with axial loads
- Identify methods to consider secondary bending moment
- Review P-delta provisions for secondary bending moment
- Describe basic differences between allowable stress design and strength design for such walls

# **Determination of Nominal and Design Strength**

• Interaction Diagram

# Design Assumptions Strength Design Guide 6.2.3.1; TMS 402 9.3.2

- $\varepsilon_{mu}$  = 0.0035 for clay masonry;  $\varepsilon_{mu}$  = 0.0025 for concrete masonry.
- · Reinforcement compression stress does not contribute to strength unless laterally supported according to TMS 402 5.3.1.4.
  - Reinforcement in walls is typically not laterally supported.
- Masonry in tension does not contribute to axial and flexural strength.
- Equivalent rectangular stress block of  $0.8f'_m$  over a depth of 0.8c.

#### Axial Strength

Strength Design Guide 6.2.2; TMS 402 9.3.4.1.1

$$P_n = 0.80 \left[ 0.80 f'_m (A_n - A_{st}) + f_y A_{st} \right] \left[ 1 - \left(\frac{h}{140r}\right)^2 \right] \quad \text{for } \frac{h}{r} \le 99$$

$$P_n = 0.80[0.80f'_m(A_n - A_{st}) + f_y A_{st}] \left(\frac{70r}{h}\right)^2 \quad \text{for } \frac{h}{r} > 99$$

 $A_{st}$  = area of laterally tied steel

## **Interaction Diagrams**

Strength Design Guide 6.2.3.2

- Assume a value of depth to neutral axis, *c*.
- Masonry compressive force:
  - For partially grouted walls, the equivalent rectangular stress block will often be in the face shell. Can treat as solid section.
- Reinforcement is often centered, so  $d = t_{sp}/2$ .
- Wall width is often taken as 1 ft, or the interaction diagram is developed on a per foot basis.
- $\phi$  = 0.9 for all combinations of flexure and axial load.







#### Interaction Diagram Strength Design Guide 6.2.3.4







Depth of stress block, *a* 

 $a = \frac{A_s f_y + P_u / \phi}{0.8 f'_m b}$ 

Design moment,  $\phi M_n$ 

$$\phi M_n = \phi \left(\frac{P_u}{\phi} + A_s f_y\right) \left(d - \frac{a}{2}\right)$$



# Design

- Estimate Reinforcement
- Maximum Reinforcement

## **Estimate Wall Thickness and Weight**

Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.2

Wall thickness: 8 in. can be used up to  $\approx$  24 ft in height (h/t = 36)

For seismic design, out-of-plane load is function of wall weight

| Wall thickness | Partial grout | Full grout |
|----------------|---------------|------------|
| 6 inch         | 35 psf        | 60 psf     |
| 8 inch         | 45 psf        | 80 psf     |
| 12 inch        | 65 psf        | 120 psf    |

16



#### **Maximum Reinforcement**

ρ

Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.4, TMS 402 9.3.3.2

- Strain gradient of  $\varepsilon_{mu}$  and  $\alpha \varepsilon_y$ , with  $\alpha$  = 1.5 for OOP loading
- $P_u$  determined from  $D + 0.75L + 0.525Q_E$  (reduces to just dead load for single story building)

Fully grouted with concentrated tension reinforcement, or partially grouted with neutral axis in face shell

Partially grouted walls with concentrated tension reinforcement and neutral axis in web

$$\rho = \frac{A_s}{bd} = \frac{0.64f'_m \left(\frac{\varepsilon_{mu}}{\varepsilon_{mu} + \alpha \varepsilon_y}\right) - \frac{P_u}{bd}}{f_y}$$

$$=\frac{0.64f'_{m}\left(\frac{\varepsilon_{mu}}{\varepsilon_{mu}+\alpha\varepsilon_{y}}\right)\left(\frac{b_{w}}{b}\right)+0.8f'_{m}t_{fs}\left(\frac{b-b_{w}}{bd}\right)-\frac{P_{u}}{bd}}{f_{y}}$$

## **Maximum Reinforcement**

Strength Design Guide Table 6.3.3-6a

Maximum Axial Load from Load Combination  $D + 0.75L + 0.525Q_E$  to Meet Maximum Reinforcement Requirements for 8 in. CMU Wall, Centered Grade 60 Reinforcement,  $f'_m = 2000$  psi

| Dar Cizo |            | Bar spacing |             |             |             |             |
|----------|------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Bar Size | 8 in.      | 16 in.      | 24 in.      | 32 in.      | 40 in.      | 48 in.      |
| No. 4    | 8.1 kip/ft | 16.1 kip/ft | 18.7 kip/ft | 20.0 kip/ft | 20.8 kip/ft | 21.4 kip/ft |
| No. 5    |            | 11.1 kip/ft | 15.4 kip/ft | 17.6 kip/ft | 18.8 kip/ft | 19.7 kip/ft |
| No. 6    |            | 5.3 kip/ft  | 11.5 kip/ft | 14.6 kip/ft | 16.5 kip/ft | 17.8 kip/ft |
| No. 7    |            |             | 6.7 kip/ft  | 11.0 kip/ft | 13.6 kip/ft | 15.4 kip/ft |

For values not listed, a tension force would be required to meet the maximum reinforcement requirements.

#### 19

# **Second Order Effects**

- Non-Linear Analysis
- Slender Wall Method
- Moment Magnification Method

## **Non-Linear Analysis**

Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.3, TMS 402 9.3.5.4.3

- · Second-order analysis: typically iterative analysis
- No axial load or h/t limits
- From TMS 402 Equations 9-23 and 9-26

$$I_e = \frac{I_{cr}}{1 - \frac{M_{cr}}{M} \left(1 - \frac{I_{cr}}{I_n}\right)}$$

## **Slender Wall Method**

Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.3, TMS 402 9.3.5.4.2

- Assumes simple support conditions
- · Assumes midheight moment is approximately maximum moment
- · Assumes uniform load over entire height
- Valid only for the following conditions:
  - $\frac{P_u}{A_n} \le 0.05 f'_m$  No height limit
  - $\frac{P_u}{A_g} \le 0.20 f_m'$  Height limited by  $\frac{h}{t} \le 30$



Slender wall method is a valid second-order method, so could be used under TMS 402 9.3.5.4.3 without any limitations.

22

#### **Slender Wall Method**

Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.3, TMS 402 9.3.5.4.2

#### Moment:

$$M_{u} = \frac{w_{u}h^{2}}{8} + P_{uf} \frac{\varepsilon_{u}}{2} + P_{u}\delta_{u}$$
$$P_{u} = P_{uw} + P_{uf}$$
$$P_{uf} = \text{factored floor load}$$
$$P_{uw} = \text{factored wall load}$$

$$\frac{\text{Deflection:}}{M_u \le M_{cr}}$$

$$\delta_u = \frac{5M_u h^2}{48 m I_n}$$

$$M_u > M_{cr}$$

$$\delta_u = \frac{5M_{cr}h^2}{48 \ mI_n} + \frac{5(M_u - M_{cr})h^2}{48E_mI_{cr}}$$

# Cracking Moment, M<sub>cr</sub> Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.3, Table 6.3.3-4; TMS 402 9.3.5.4.2

$$M_{cr} = \frac{(P_u/A_n + f_r)I_n}{t_{sp}/2}$$

|                      | Modulus of Rupture (psi)                 |        |  |        |
|----------------------|--|--------|--|--------|
| Grout Spacing (inch) | Portland cement/Lime or mortar<br>cement |        | Masonry cement or air<br>entrained PCL |        |
|                      | Type M or S                              | Type N | Type M or S                            | Type N |
| Fully Grouted        | 163                                      | 158    | 153                                    | 145    |
| 16                   | 124                                      | 111    | 102                                    | 88     |
| 24                   | 110                                      | 95     | 85                                     | 69     |
| 32                   | 104                                      | 88     | 77                                     | 60     |
| 40                   | 100                                      | 83     | 71                                     | 54     |
| 48                   | 97                                       | 80     | 68                                     | 50     |
| Ungrouted            | 84                                       | 64     | 51                                     | 31     |

## Cracked Moment of Inertia, *I*<sub>cr</sub>

Strength Design Guide 6.3.3.3, Table 6.3.3-5; TMS 402 9.3.5.4.2

Cracked moment of inertia (fully grouted, or partially grouted wall with neutral axis in face shell):

$$I_{cr} = n \left( A_s + \frac{P_u t_{sp}}{f_y 2d} \right) (d-c)^2 + \frac{bc^3}{3}$$
  
Modification for non-centered bars;  
= 1 for centered bars

Depth to neutral axis:  $c = \frac{A_s f_y + P_u}{0.64 f'_m b}$ 





29

# **Bearing Wall Example**

• Strength Design Guide Example 6.3.3.10



#### **Bearing Wall: Design Tips**

- Load combination is 0.9*D* + 1.0*W* typically governs.
- Negative wind pressure typically governs over positive wind pressure.
  - Negative pressure (components and cladding) is generally higher than the positive pressure.
  - Moment from the eccentric axial load is additive with the moment from the negative wind pressure for the typical case of the eccentricity being towards the inside of the building.
- Wind load on parapet will reduce midheight moment.
  - Parapets that are less than 20% of the height of the wall can be neglected when determining the midheight moment, with the impact being less than 8%.
  - Parapet wind load included in example for completeness.

#### **Bearing Wall: Estimate Reinforcement**

Moment, 
$$M_u = \frac{w_u h^2}{8} = \frac{30psf(16.67ft)^2 \frac{12 in.}{ft}}{8} = 12,500 \frac{lb-in.}{ft}$$

Wall weight is estimated as 45 psf

Axial load, 
$$P_u = 0.9D = 0.9 \left( 700 \frac{lb}{ft} + 45 psf\left( 3.33 ft + \frac{16.67 ft}{2} \right) \right) = 1,100 \frac{lb}{ft}$$

Estimate 
$$A_{s,reqd}$$
  $A_{s,reqd} \sim \frac{M_u}{0.8f_y d} - \frac{P_u}{f_y} = \frac{12,500\frac{lb-in.}{ft}}{0.8(60,000psi)(3.81in.)} - \frac{1,100\frac{lb}{ft}}{60,000psi} = 0.050\frac{in.^2}{ft}$ 

Try No. 4 @ 48 in. (0.05 in.<sup>2</sup>/ft) actual wall weight = 44 psf

32

## **Bearing Wall: Properties**

| Net section properties<br>NCMA TEK 14-1B | $A_n$ = 40.7 in. <sup>2</sup> /ft; $S_n$ = 87.1 in. <sup>3</sup> /ft; $I_n$ = 332.0 in. <sup>4</sup> /ft   |    |
|--|--|----|
| Modulus of rupture                       | Type S masonry cement, 48 inch grout spacing, $f_r$ = 68 psi   |    |
| Cracking moment                          | $M_{cr} = \left(\frac{P_u}{A_n} + f_r\right) S_n = \left(\frac{1,100\frac{\text{lb}}{\text{ft}}}{40.7\frac{\text{in.}^2}{\text{ft}}} + 68\text{psi}\right) 87.1\frac{\text{in.}^3}{\text{ft}} = 8,280\frac{\text{lb}\cdot\text{in.}}{\text{ft}}$ |    |
| Compressive strength                     | $f'_m$ = 2000 psi (TMS 602, Table 2)   |    |
| Modulus of elasticity                    | $E_m = 900(f'_m) = 900(2,000psi) = 1,800,000 psi$  |    |
|  |  | 33 |

## **Bearing Wall:** *I*<sub>cr</sub>

| Modular ratio                | $n = \frac{E_s}{E_m} = \frac{29,000,000 \ ps}{1,800,000 \ ksi} = 16.1$   |
|------------------------------|--|
| Depth to neutral axis        | $c = \frac{A_s f_y + P_u}{0.64 f'_m b} = \frac{0.05 \frac{\text{in.}^2}{\text{ft}} (60,000 \text{ psi}) + 1,100 \frac{\text{lb}}{\text{ft}}}{0.64 (2,000 \text{ psi}) 12 \frac{\text{in.}}{\text{ft}}} = 0.267 \text{ in.}$  |
| Cracked Moment<br>of Inertia | $I_{cr} = n \left( A_s + \frac{P_u}{f_y} \right) (d-c)^2 + \frac{bc^3}{3}$<br>= 16.1 $\left( 0.05 \frac{\text{in.}^2}{\text{ft}} + \frac{1.100 \frac{\text{lb}}{\text{ft}}}{60,000 \text{ psi}} \right) (3.812 \text{in.} - 0.267 \text{in.})^2 + \frac{12 \frac{\text{in.}}{\text{ft}} (0.267 \text{in.})^3}{3}$<br>= 13.9 $\frac{\text{in.}^4}{\text{ft}}$ |



#### **Bearing Wall: Moment at Top**

TMS 402 assumes simple span.

Replace  $P_{uf}e_u$  with moment at top of wall,  $M_{uf}$ 

$$M_{uf} = P_{uf}e_u - \frac{w_u h_p^2}{2} = 0.9 \left(700 \frac{\text{lb}}{\text{ft}}\right) (2.48 \text{ in.}) - \frac{30 \text{ psf}(3.33 \text{ft})^2 \left(12 \frac{\text{in.}}{\text{ft}}\right)}{2} = -437 \frac{\text{lb} \cdot \text{in}}{\text{ft}}$$



#### **Bearing Wall: Check Capacity**

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{Depth of stress}\\ \text{block, } a & a = \frac{A_s f_y + P_u / \phi}{0.8 f'_m b} = \frac{0.05 \frac{\text{in.}^2}{\text{ft}} (60,000 \text{psi}) + 1,090 \frac{\text{lb}}{\text{ft}} / 0.9}{0.8 (2,000 \text{psi}) \left(12 \frac{\text{in.}}{\text{ft}}\right)} = 0.219 \text{in.} \\ \phi M_n &= \phi \left(\frac{P_u}{\phi} + A_s f_y\right) \left(d - \frac{a}{2}\right) \\ = 0.9 \left(\frac{1,090 \frac{\text{lb}}{\text{ft}}}{0.9} + 0.05 \frac{\text{in.}^2}{\text{ft}} (60,000 \text{pksi})\right) \left(3.812 \text{in.} - \frac{0.219 \text{in.}}{2}\right) \\ &= 0.9 (15,600 \frac{\text{lb} \cdot \text{in.}}{\text{ft}}) = 14,000 \frac{\text{lb} \cdot \text{in.}}{\text{ft}} \\ \end{array}$$
Check capacity
$$\begin{array}{l} M_u &= 13,300 \frac{\text{lb} \cdot \text{in.}}{\text{ft}} \leq 14,000 \frac{\text{lb} \cdot \text{in.}}{\text{ft}} = \phi M_n \end{array}$$

With factored moment being 95% of the design moment, this is an efficient design.

#### **Bearing Wall: Load Combinations**

| Load Combination               | $M_u$ (lb·in./ft) | $P_u$ (lb/ft) | $\phi M_n$ (lb·in./ft) | $M_u / \phi M_n$ |
|--------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|------------------------|------------------|
| 0.9D + 1.0W                    | 13,300            | 1,090         | 14,000                 | 0.95             |
| 1.2D + 1.6L <sub>r</sub> +0.5W | 7,500             | 1,940         | 17,100                 | 0.44             |
| 1.2D + 0.5L +1.0W              | 14,300            | 1,610         | 15,900                 | 0.90             |

#### **Bearing Wall: Maximum Reinforcement**

 $P = D + 0.75L + 0.525Q_E = 700\frac{lb}{ft}$ 

From previous table, maximum axial load for No. 4 @ 48 in. is 21.4 kip/ft

### **Bearing Wall: Deflections**

Deflections are checked using ASD load combinations. A quick check can be made using SD Load Combinations, TMS 402 Equation 9-26.

$$\begin{split} \delta_{u} &= \frac{5M_{cr}h^{2}}{48} + \frac{5(M_{u} - M_{cr})h^{2}}{48E_{m}l_{cr}} \\ &= \frac{5\left(8,260\frac{lb\cdot i}{ft}\right)(16.67ft)^{2}\left(12\frac{in}{ft}\right)^{2}}{48(1,800,000psi)\left(332\frac{in\cdot^{4}}{ft}\right)} + \frac{5\left(13,30\frac{lb\cdot in}{ft} - 8,260\frac{lb\cdot i}{ft}\right)(16.67ft)^{2}\left(12\frac{in}{ft}\right)^{2}}{48(1,800,000psi)\left(13.9\frac{in\cdot^{4}}{ft}\right)} = 0.90in. \end{split}$$

Allowable Deflection  $0.007h = 0.007(16.67ft)12\frac{in.}{ft} = 1.40in.$ 

When checking deflections, typically the load combination D + 0.6W results in the largest deflection.

#### 41

ОК

# **Example: Seismic Loads**

• Strength Design Guide Example 6.3.3.12

43

#### **Seismic Loads**

Warehouse building from FEMA P-1051

- Type S Portland cement/lime mortar
- $f'_m$  = 2000 psi
- Grade 60 reinforcement
- $S_{DS}$  = 1.43 and  $I_e$  = 1.0
- Roof dead load of 400lb/ft at 3.5 in. from inside face of wall
- Because of the height of the wall, 12 in. CMU will be used, resulting in an *h/t*=28
- Two layers of reinforcement will be used, with a 2 in. cover (1.25 in. face shell, 0.25 in. taper, and 0.5 in. for coarse grout)

After 2015 NEHRP Recommended Seismic Provisions: Design Examples FEMA P-1051 / July 2016



## **Seismic Loads**

- Due to an anticipated higher level of reinforcement (and hence more grouted cells) and grouted bond beams, assume a wall weight 90 psf.
- The out-of-plane seismic force ASCE 7-16 Section 12.11.1
  - $w_u = 0.4S_{DS}I_e w_{wall} = 0.4(1.43)(1)(2)(90psf) = 51.5psf$
- Estimate the required reinforcement based on a uniform load of 51.5psf(16ft) = 824lb/ft
  - Try a No. 6 bar to determine *d* (11.625in.-2in.-0.75in./2=9.25in.). Since the axial load is small, ignore the axial load in the estimate of the reinforcement.

• 
$$A_{s,reqd} \sim \frac{M_u}{0.8f_y d} = \frac{824 \frac{10}{ft} (28ft)^2/8}{0.8(60,000psi)(9.25in.\frac{1f}{12in.})} = 2.2in.^2$$

• Try 5 - #6 bars ( $A_s = 5(0.44in.^2) = 2.2 in.^2$ )



#### Loads

- Check load combination  $0.9D E_v + E_h$ .
- Axial load at the top of the wall:

• 
$$P_{uf} = (0.9 - 0.2S_{DS})D = (0.9 - 0.2(1.43))(400\frac{lb}{ft})(20ft) = 4,910lb$$

- Load, shear, and moment diagrams are shown in the following. Following FEMA 1051, the weight of the overhead doors is neglected. For some types of doors, the weight could be 7-10 psf, which could affect the design.
- Factored axial load at location of maximum moment
  - $P_u = P_{uf} + P_{uw} = 4,910lb + (0.9 0.2(1.43))(90psf)(20ft)(12.3ft) = 18,500lb$

46



# **Cracked Moment of Inertia**

Depth to  
neutral axis, c  

$$c = \frac{A_s f_y + P_u}{0.64 \ mb} = \frac{5(0.44in^2)(60,000psi) + 18,500lb}{0.64(2,000psi)(96in.)} = 1.22in.$$
c is in face shell  
Cracked  
moment of  
inertia,  $I_{cr} = n\left(A_s + \frac{P_u}{f_y}\frac{t_{sp}}{2d}\right)(d-c)^2 + \frac{bc^3}{3}$   
 $= 16.11\left(2.20in.^2 + \frac{18,500lb}{60,000psi}\frac{11.625in.}{2(9.25in.)}\right)(9.25in. -1.22in.)^2 + \frac{96in.(1.22in.)^3}{3}$   
 $= 2,540in.^4$ 

## **Magnified Moment**

Buckling load, Pe

$$P_e = \frac{\pi^2 E_m I_{eff}}{h^2} = \frac{\pi^2 (1,800,000 psi)(2,540 in.^4)}{\left(28 f t \frac{12 in}{ft}\right)^2} = 400,000 lb$$

Moment magnifier,  $\psi$   $\psi = \frac{1}{1 - \frac{P_u}{P_e}} = \frac{1}{1 - \frac{18,500lb}{400,000lb}} = 1.05$ 

Factored moment,  $M_{\eta}$ 

 $M_u = \psi M_{u,0} = 1.05(82,000 lb \cdot ft) = 86,000 lb \cdot ft$ 

#### **Check Capacity**

 $a = \frac{A_s f_y + P_u / \phi}{0.8 f'_m b} = \frac{2.2 i n.^2 (60,000 p si) + 1,500l / .9}{0.8 (2,000 p s) (96 i n.)} = 0.993 i n.$ Depth of stress block, a Nominal  $M_n = \left(\frac{P_u}{\phi} + A_s f_y\right) \left(\frac{t_{sp} - a}{2}\right) + A_s f_y \left(d - \frac{t_{sp}}{2}\right)$ moment,  $M_n$   $= \left(\frac{18,500lb}{0.9} + 2.20in.^2 (60,000psi)\right) \left(\frac{11.625in. - 0.993in.}{2}\right) + 2.20in.^2 (60,000psi) \left(9.25in. - \frac{11.625in.}{2}\right)$   $= 105,400 \ lb \cdot in.$ If second layer of reinforcement had been included,  $M_n = 111,300 \ lb \cdot in$ ., a 6% increase.

Check

 $\phi M_n = 0.9(105,400 \ lb \cdot ft) = 94,800 \ lb \cdot ft > M_u = 86,000 \ lb \cdot ft$ capacity

Check other load combinations

For **1.2D** +  $\mathbf{E}_{\mathbf{v}}$  +  $\mathbf{E}_{\mathbf{h}}$ ,  $\psi$  = 1.12  $M_u$  = 95,100 lb-ft  $\phi M_n$  = 105,000 lb-ft

50

#### **Maximum Reinforcement**

Strength Design Guide, Example 6.3.3.9: Good Structural Design Tip:

• Maximum axial load > 25 kip/ft with 12 in. CMU and two layers of reinforcement

For pier, maximum axial load > 25kip/ft(8ft) = 200 kip/ft

· Maximum reinforcement requirements met by inspection

#### **Deflections**

Quick check of deflections:

- Use ASD load of 0.7(1030 lb/ft) = 721 lb/ft (OOP load above opening)
- Use cracked moment of inertia of 2540 in.<sup>4</sup>
- Use moment magnifier of 1.05

$$\delta = \psi \frac{5wh^4}{384EI} = 1.05 \frac{5(721\frac{lb}{ft})(28ft)^4 1728\frac{in.^3}{ft^3}}{384(1,800,000\ psi)(2540\ in.^4)} = 2.30\ in.$$

Allowable deflection:  $0.007(28ft)\left(12\frac{in}{ft}\right) = 2.35in$ .

Detailed Calculations in Strength Design Guide

52

# **Comparison to ASD**

#### **Allowable Stress Design**

- No second-order analysis required
- Allowable tension stress controls
  - Wind load: approximately the same reinforcement
  - Seismic load: the 0.7 factor for seismic in ASD causes SD to often require slightly less reinforcement
- Allowable masonry stress controls
  - ASD is inefficient, with SD requiring significantly less reinforcement

55

## ASD vs. SD

- Bearing wall design
  - SD:  $M_u/\phi M_n = 0.95$
  - ASD:  $M/M_{all} = 0.90$
- Seismic example
  - Ignoring second layer or reinforcement
    - SD:  $M_u / \phi M_n = 0.91$
    - ASD:  $M/M_{all} = 1.02$
  - Including second layer of reinforcement
    - SD:  $M_u/\phi M_n = 0.86$
    - ASD:  $M/M_{all} = 1.02$  (kd = 2.83in > 2.38in = d')

